Effect of Zataria multiflora Boiss essential oil on the growth of Staphylococcus aureus in the light salted fillets of silver carp (Hypophthalmichthys molitrix)

Choobkar N.¹*; Soltani M.²; Ebrahimzadeh Mousavi H. A.²; Akhonzadeh Basti A.³; Matinfar A.⁴

Received: October 2009 Accepted: December 2009

Abstract

The effects of different concentrations of *Zataria multiflora* essential oils at concentrations of 0, 0.005, 0.015, 0.045, 0.135, 0.405 and 0.810% on the growth of *Staphylococcus aureus* were studied in a food model system, light salted fillets of silver carp (*Hypophthalmichthys molitrix*) at storage temperature of 10°C for 21 days. The results showed that there was no significant difference in bacterial growth between samples treated with different concentrations of *Z. multiflora* essential oil and control group immediately post-inoculation. However, there was significant difference in growth of *S. aureus* between samples treated with concentration of 0.135 of *Z. multiflora* essential oil and control samples (*P*<0.05) on 2 and 6 days post-storage. No significant difference was observed on the growth of *S. aureus* in samples treated with lower concentrations of *Z. multiflora* (below 0.045%) compared with control group (*P*>0.05) except of 1-day post-storage. The most inhibitorial effects were observed in the samples treated with 0.405% and 0.810% of *Z. multiflora* essential oil up to 9 and 12 days post-storage, respectively.

Keywords: Staphylococcus aureus, Light salting, Silver carp fillet, Zataria multiflora essential oil

¹⁻Department of Fisheries, Faculty of Agriculture and Natural Resources, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.

²⁻Department of Aquatic Animals Health, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran.

³⁻ Department of Food Hygiene, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran.

⁴⁻ Iranian Fisheries Research Organization, Tehran, Iran.

^{*}Corresponding author's email: Nchoobkar@iauksh.ac.ir

Introduction

There are numerous reports of infections and food poisoning transmitted pathogens through raw and processed products (Prasad and Seenayya, 2000). Two percents of total sea food products in the world is consumed in the form of salted and smoked fish (Basti et al., 2006). Staphylococcus aureus is one of the common bacterial food pathogens causing food poisoning worldwide (Basti et al., 2006). In a study by Arkoudelos et al. (2003),S. aureus and Salmonella typhimurium survived up to 90 days in salted sardine. Human infections can be transmitted by fish or the environment. Factors such as season. nutrition and immune system of the person can also impact the extent of the infection. Food microbial contaminations can be constrained by some preservatives such as organic acids and also by some physical and chemical methods (Youzbashi, 2001). Today, due to harmful effects of chemical food preservatives, there is a demand for use of natural preservatives derived from plant, animal and microbial resources which improve the human immune system (Burt, 2004). Furthermore, the world health organization has recently called for a worldwide reduction in the consumption of salt in order to reduce the incidence of cardio-vascular disease. To reduce the level of salt in the processed foods and maintain the safety of human foods, using natural preservatives such as essential oils of plants are the best choice (Ultee et al., 2002; Radmehr, 2006; Vandendriessche, 2008). Z. multiflora (namely Avishan-e Shirazi) is one of the plants with known anti-bacterial and antioxidant effects (Burt, 2004). anti-bacterial Although the properties Z. multiflora essential oils

against some pathogenic bacteria including S. aureus is well known (Radmehr, 2006; Akhondzadeh et al., 2007; Fazeli et al., 2007 ;Moosavy, 2007) , such antibacterial properties have been demonstrated just in laboratory scale using artificial media. Fish meat is one of the important food products that can be rapidly contaminated by human pathogenic microorganisms (Wang and Shelef, 1992; Prasad and Seenayya, 2000; Barakat et al., 2004). In a study by Goulas and Kontominas (2007), the combined treatment of modified atmosphere packaging (MAP: 40% CO2/ 30% O2/ 30% N2) and oregano essential oil were studied on the shelf-life of lightly salted cultured sea bream (Sparus aurata) fillets stored under refrigeration. Salting had a noticeable preservative effect oregano oil had a strong antioxidant activity. Also they showed that the fillets treated with 0.8% oregano oil were still sensorly acceptable. The objective of this study was to evaluate the antibacterial effects of Z. multiflora essential oils (0.005, 0.015, 0.045, 0.135, 0.405 and 0.810%) on the growth of S. aureus in a food model system, (light salted fillet of silver carp with NaCl less than 5 %), under unfavorable refrigeration storage provided at 10°C for 21 days to poisoning dose limit >10⁶ (Varnam and Evans, 1991).

Materials and methods

Z. multiflora was collected from Shiraz Province, Iran and was identified by the Institute of Medical Plants, Tehran, Iran. Air-dried aerial parts of the plant were subjected to steam distillation for 2 h using Clevenger-type apparatus. The essential oil yield of the air-dried material was analysed

by gas chromatography mass spectrometry (GC-MS) (Thermoquest2000, UK). The chromatograph was equipped with DB5 capillary column (30 0.25mm ID 0.25 mm film thickness) and the data were acquired under the following temperature conditions: initial temperature at 50°C; program rate at 2.5°C; final temperature at 265°C and finally injector temperature at 250°C were adjusted. The carrier gas was Helium and the split ratio was 120. The MS was run in the electron ionization mode, using ionization energy of 70 eV (Akhondzadeh et al., 2007). A lyophilized culture of S. aureus (ATCC 6538) obtained from the culture collection in the Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University Tehran, Iran, was used in this study. The lyophilized culture was grown in tube containing 10 ml of Brain Heart Infusion (BHI) broth (Merck) at 35°C for 18 h before use (Akhondzadeh et al., 2007). A 13×100 mm sterile cuvette containing 5 ml of sterile BHI broth was provided. The bacterial cells of S. aureus grown in the broth were adjusted to an optical density (OD) of 0.02 at 600 nm using the Spectronic 20 spectrophotometer (Milton Roy Company, USA). This adjustment gave a cell concentration of 1×10^7 cfu ml⁻ ¹. The number of cells in the suspension was estimated by duplicate plating from ten-fold serial dilutions of sterile 0.1% peptone water (Merck) on BHI agar and the bacterial colonies were counted after 24 h incubation at 35°C. Finally, fish fillets were inoculated with S. aureus at 1×10^3 cfu /cm³. (Akhondzadeh et al., 2007). A brine water of 4% NaCl (w/v) (Merck) was prepared using distilled water in the sterile screw capped flasks. Lecithin as stable oilwater emulsifier at 1% (v/v) and agar-agar stabilizer at 0.05% (w/v) (Merck) were

added to the flasks. The flasks were then autoclaved at 121°C for 15 min. Z. multiflora essential oil at concentrations of 0.005, 0.015, 0.045, 0.135, 0.405 and 0.810 % as treatments along with a control group (without Z. multiflora essential oil) were prepared. Fresh fillet of silver carp obtained from a fish farm were transported at 4°C to the laboratory of Iranian Atomic Energy Organization and several pieces of 25 gram fillets with 3×8 cm² in size were immediately prepared and were steriled by Gamma Ray at a dose of 3 KGray (Nyka"nen et al., 2000). A number of 12 fillets, (with chemical analysis of 76.8% moisture, 2% fat, 23% protein), were placed in each flask containing high concentrations of Z. multiflora essential oils. The flasks were then placed in a refrigerator at 5°C for 24 h. Each treatment was included in tri-replicates. After 24 h, the fillets were transferred into the new empty sterile bags and each treatment was inoculated with 10³ cfu/cm³ in 10 points of surface of each fillet (Barakat et al., 2006). The bag cabs were firmly closed, labeled and placed in an incubator at unfavorable refrigeration storage temperature of 10°C. To obtain the limit of toxicity dose of S. aureus, i.e $>10^6$ cfu/g, the bacteria were cultured from each treatment immediately at post-inoculation and on days 1, 2, 3, 6, 9, 12, 15, 18, 19 and 21. Each fillet of each treatment was removed and 225 ml sterile 0.1% (w/v) peptone water (Merck) added to it. Samples were then blended in a stomacher 400 (Lab Blender 400, Seward Medical Ltd., London, UK) for 3 min and diluted in sterile 0.1% (w/v) peptone water prior to inoculation on duplicate plates of enrichment culture of Baird-Parker agar containing (Merck) egg yolk potassium telluride (Merck) (American Public Health Association, APHA, 1992) and then incubated at 37°C for 48 h. The number of *S. aureu*s was determined as cfu/g of test samples.

The sensory-derived effects of adding Z. multiflora essential oil were evaluated by an acceptance test (Krishnamurthy et al., 2007) in samples treated with 0.135, 0.405 and 0.810% Z. multiflora essential oil in 1 and 3 days post-incubation. An eight-member trained panel was used to evaluate sensory color, odor, and overall acceptability attributes of fish meat treated with essential oils. Panelists were selected among students of the faculty before evaluation and treated fish meat samples cooked in a steam-cooker for 30 min by them. Each sample was served warm in dishes coded with 3-digit random numbers and presented in individual booths to each panelist for evaluation. A 3-point hedonic scale was used to score sensory attributes, where:

1: not acceptable, 2: relatively acceptable, 3: highly acceptable.

The effects of different concentrations of Z. multiflora essential oil on growth of S. aureus were evaluated using SPSS 15.0 statistical software (SPSS 15.0 for windows, SPSS Inc.) and analyzed the logarithm of total count of the bacteria by Tukey Test. Results were considered statistically significant when P < 0.05.

Results

The \log_{10} (cfu ml⁻¹ or g⁻¹) of *S. aureus* in silver carp fillets treated with different concentrations of *Z. multiflora* essential oil at 0, 0.005, 0.015, 0.045, 0.135, 0.405 and 0.810 % at storage time are showed in Table 1. The obtained results showed that the bacterial growth in samples treated with different concentrations of *Z. multiflora* essential oil had not significant

difference compared with control group immediately post-inoculation but samples treated with concentration of 0.135 of Z. multiflora essential oil had a significant decrease on the growth of S. aureus compared with control samples (P<0.05)on 2 and 6 days post-storage. No significant difference was seen on the growth of S. aureus in samples treated with lower concentrations of Z. multiflora (below 0.045%) compared with control group (P>0.05) except on 1 days poststorage. The inhibitoriest effects were seen in the samples treated with 0.405\% and 0.810% of Z. multiflora essential oil up to 9 and 12 days post-storage, respectively.

The results of organoleptic evaluation of treated fillets showed that samples treated with 0.135 and 0.405% essential oil were highly acceptable (scale 3) on 3 days post-incubation while samples treated with 0.810% essential oil were relatively acceptable (scale 2) 1 day post-incubation. Other treated samples were not evaluated sensory acceptable.

Discussion

Various studies were carried out on using of different preservatives for increasing shelf life of fish fillets and delaying microbial growth (Goulas Kontominas, 2007; Motalebi et al., 2010; Rostamzad et al., 2010) as the antibacterial activity of plant essential oils and their components could be considered suitable for application on food products. The current knowledge on potential antagonistic and synergistic features of such plants were presented by Burt (2004). Zataria multiflora Boiss is a native Iranian herb and its essential oil is vastly used as a food preservative and medical drug (Burt, 2004). In the present study fillets treated with essential oil at concentration 0.405% showed an improved organoleptic property compared with other treatments. Of course sensory acceptance depends on type of fish feeding, season of catching, fish size as well as other environmental factors. Lastly it is directly related to microbial activity in

Table 1: Log₁₀(cfuml⁻¹ or g ⁻¹) of *S. aureus* in silver carp fillets samples treated with different concentrations of *Z. multiflora* essential oil (Log ±SD)

				, ,	, ,			
Time				day				
(day)								
Z.	0	1	2	3	6	9	12	15
multiflora								
e. o.conc								
(%)								
0.00	2.95°±0.048	3.14 ^a ±0.009	5.01°±0.577	6.41 ^a ±0.015	8·11 ^a ±0.131	8.80°±0.086	-	-
0.0005	3.04 ^a ±0.039	$3.74^{b} \pm 0.007$	$5.32^{b}\pm0.020$	6.39 ^a ±0.001	7.69 ^a ±0.004	$7.68^a \pm 0.001$		
0.015	$3.04^a \pm 0.039$	$3.89^{b} \pm 0.005$	$5.32^{b}\pm0.002$	$6.38^a \pm 0.001$	$7.69^{a}\pm0.043$	$7.65^a \pm 0.001$	-	-
0.045	3.07 ^a ±0.036	$3.84^{b}\pm0.031$	$6.32^a \pm 0.001$	$7.66^{a}\pm0.004$	8.56 ^a ±0.092	-	-	-
0.135	3.04 ^a ±0.039	$3.63^{b} \pm 0.010$	$4.70^{\circ} \pm 0.008$	$6.08^a \pm 0.003$	$6.61^{b}\pm0.010$	$7.34^a \pm 0.039$	$7.30^{b}\pm0.003$	-
0.405	2.99 ^a ±0.043	3.00°±0.033	$3.41^{d}\pm0.016$	$4.30^{b}\pm0.021$	5.88°±0.005	5.66 ^b ±0.571	$7.47^{b}\pm0.014$	$7.86^{a}\pm0.00$
0.810	2.95 ^a ±0.048	1.95°±0.241	2.46 ^e ±0.151	3.04°±0.039	$4.11^{d} \pm 0.033$	5.90 ^b ±0.005	6.43°±0.016	$8.00^a \pm 0.012^a$

Different letters showing significant difference (*P*<0.05).

the fish tissue (Goulas and Kontominas, 2007). In a study by Barakat et al. (2004) the effects of garlic oil and combinations essential of some oils including allylisothiocyanate, carvacrol, cinnamaldehyde, citral, cuminnaldehyde, eugenol, isoeugenol, linalool and thymol were studied on the natural microflora in carp meat. Maximum inhibitory effect were observed by carvacryl, thymol and cinnmaldehyde against Acinetobacter, Alcaligenes, Bacillus, Flavobacterium, Micrococcus, Moraxella and Pseudomonas and two families of Enterobacteriaceae and Vibrionaceae. The carvacrol is one the components presented essential oils of Z. multiflora which the inhibitory effect on the growth of S. aureus could mainly create due to this component. Bonyadian and Karim (2002) showed inhibitory effects of the volatile oil such as thyme, cumin, menta, oregano and tarragon on the growth of S. aureus and

the most inhibitory effect recorded by thyme which is a dominant component of Z. multiflora essential oil. In a study by Alipour (2007) samples of commercial barley soup (liquid media) treated with concentrations of 0.005, 0.015 and 0.03 % of Z. multiflora essential oil showed a significant inhibitory effect (P<0.05)against the growth of Bacillus cereus at 15 and 25°C for 21 days and while the temperature decreased, growth rate of the bacteria decreased. The antimicrobial activity of essential oils is benefited by a decrease in storage temperature (Burt, 2004). Moosavy et al. (2008) studied the effect of different concentrations of Z. multiflora essential oils on the growth of S. aureus in both temperature of 8 and 25°C resulted in greater inhibitory effect at 8°C than 25°C. Thus viable count of the bacteria could affect by the storage temperature. Also, in this study we used unfavorable refrigeration temperature of

⁻ = Not detected because of higher number of S. aureus detected (>10⁶ cells) in samples.

e. o. Conc= essential oil Concentration

10°C at which can enhance the growth of S. aureus as well as the spoilage of fish fillet. In addition, the results of other workers (Wang and Shelef, 1992; Tassou et al., 2000; Gutierrez et al., 2008) showed that the effectiveness of essential oils decreased when the experiments were conducted in the "in vivo conditions". This could be due to high protein and fat contents of meat which can mask the antimicrobial effect of essential oils. In this study, the effectiveness of Z. multiflora essential oil also reduced in the in vivo conditions (fish fillet) which contains high protein content therefore it seems that higher concentrations of essential oil is necessary to preserve the food products such as fish fillet in the in vivo condition compare with in vitro condition, e.g., liquid food products. Essential oil is hydrophobic in nature and so is more soluble in the lipid phase of food while microorganisms sit in the hydrophilic portion. These reactions may reduce opportunity for contact between the antimicrobial substances of Z. multiflora essential oil and the target organism. In addition the fat and protein content and pH of food system are important factors affecting the activity of essential oils (Tassou et al., 2000; Burt, 2004). In a study by Singh et al. (2003), different plant essential oils against Listeria monocytogenes in hotdogs (rigid media), was reduced the bacterial population but the antimicrobial action was highly dependent on the fat content of hotdogs. Also, Burt (2004) suggested that herbs do have greater effect in broth culture medium than in food as said previously. Barakat et al. (2006)studied combination effects of NaCl 0.85% and essential oil compounds contains of 0.5% carvacrol and 0.5% thymol on fillets of

carp fish and showed that the combination of NaCl saline 0.85% and thymol and carvacrol enhanced storage time at 5 and 10°C in carp fish fillets which is in agreement with the results obtained in this study. In another study, the antimicrobial effect of Z. multiflora essential oil at 0.3%, 0.6%, or 0.9% and nisin at 500 or 1000 IU/g and their combination against Listeria monocytogenes was examined in both tryptic soy broth (TSB) and minced beef meat. Z. multiflora essential oil at 0.3% possessed a weak antibacterial activity against the pathogen in TSB, whereas at 0.9% showed unacceptable organoleptic properties in minced meat. Thus, only the level of 0.6% of Z. multiflora essential oil was further examined against the pathogen in minced meat. Treatment of minced beef meat with Z. multiflora essential oil at 0.6% and nisin 1000 IU/g showed stronger inhibitory activity against monocytogenes (Solomakos et al., 2007). In minced beef meat, the content of protein, fat and moisture were 21.8%, 2.4% and 72.2%, respectively, while in this study these contents were 23%, 2% and 76.8% respectively. Obviously more studies are needed on the antimicrobial properties of essential oils and their compounds before they can be used as food preservatives. Based on studies of Moreira et al. (2005), further studies are needed to investigate the oils incorporation into appropriate food formulations, and evaluate flavor, chemical changes and antimicrobial effect in the whole food system. In conclusion, the obtained results of this study suggest a possible application of Z. multiflora essential oil as a food natural preservative in fish fillet. However more studies are required to verify the precise conclusions of essential provided at different storage temperatures.

Acknowledgements

The authors are grateful of the staff in the Department of Food Hygiene, University of Tehran: particularly Dr Ekhtivarzadeh and Dr A. Sari and also Dr in the Islamic Farshid, Azad University; Kermanshah Branch and Dr S. Kakoolaki in the Iranian Fisheries Research Organization for their guidance in the study.

References

- Akhondzadeh, A., Misaghi, A. and Khaschabi, D., 2007. Growth response and modelling of the effects of *Zataria multiflora* Boiss. essential oil, pH and temperature on *Salmonella typhimurium* and *Staphylococcus aureus*. LWT -Food Science and Technology, 40, 973-981.
- Alipour, M., 2007. Study effect of thyme essential oil, nisin and preservation temperature on *Bacillus cereus* in a food model system(commercial barley soup) using hurdle technology. PhD. Tehran; University of Tehran.
- **American Public Health Association, 1992.** Compendium of methods for the microbiological examination (3rd ed.), Washington, APHA. pp. 105–119, 325–367, 371–415, 451–469, 637–658.
- Arkoudelos, J. S., Samaras, F. J. and Tassou, C. C., 2003. Survival of Staphylococcus aureus and Salmonella enteritidis on salted sardines. Food Protection, 66,1479-1481.
- Barakat, S. M. Mahmoud., Yamazaki, K., Milyasita, K., II- Shik,Sh., Dong Suk.,Ch. and Suzuki, T., 2004. Bacterial microflora of carp (*Cyprinus carpio*) and its shelf- life extension by essential oil compounds. *Food*

- Microbiology, 21, 657-666.
- Barakat, S. M., Mahmoud, Yamazaki, K., Miyashita, K., Il. Shik, Sh. and Suzuki, T., 2006. A new technology for fish preservation by combined treatment with electrolyzed NaCl solutions and essential oil compounds. *Food Chemistry*, 99, 656-662.
- Basti, A. A., Misaghi, A., Salehi, T. Z. and Kamkar, A., 2006. Bacterial pathogens in fresh, smoked and salted Iranian fish. *Food Control*, 17, 183-188.
- **Burt, S., 2004**. Essential oils: their antibacterial properties and potential application in foods-a review. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 94, 223-253.
- Fazeli, M. R., Amin, Gh., Ahmadian Attari, M. M., Ashtiani, H., Attari, M. M., Ashtiani,
- Jamalifar, H and Samadi, N., 2007. Antimicrobial activities of Iranian sumac and avishan-e shirazi (*Zataria multiflora*) against some food-borne bacteria. *Food Control*, 18, 646-649.
- Goulas, A. E. and Kontominas, M. G., 2007. Combined effect of light salting, modified atmosphere packaging and oregano essential oil on the shelf-life of sea bream (*Sparus aurata*): Biochemical and sensory attributes. *Food Chemistry*, 100, 287–296.
- Gutierrez, J., Barry-Ryan, C. and Bourke, P., 2008. The antimicrobial efficacy of plant essential oil combinations and interactions with food ingredients. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 124, 91–97.
- Krishnamurthy, R., Srivastava, A. K., Paton, J. E., Bell, G. A. and Levy, D.

- C., 2007. Prediction of consumer liking from trained sensory panel information:Evalution of neural networks. *Food Quality and* Preference, 18, 275-278.
- Moosavy, M., Akhondzadeh Basti, A., Misaghi, A., Zahraei salehi, T., Abbasifar, R., Mousavi, H., Alipour, M., et al., 2008. Effect of *Zataria multiflora* Boiss essential oil and nisin on *Staphylococcus aureus* and *Salmonella typhimurium* in a food model system and on the bacterial cell membranes. *Food Research* International, 41, 1050-1057.
- Moreira, M. R., Ponce, A. G., Del Valle, C. E. and Roura, S. I., 2005. Inhibitory parameters of essential oils to reduce a foodborne pathogen. *Food Science and Technology*, 38, 565–570.
- Motalebi, A. A., Hasanzati Rostami, A., Khanipour, A. A. and Soltani, M., 2010. Impacts of whey protein edible coating on chemical and microbial factors of gutted kilka during frozen storage. *Iranian Journal of Fisheries Sciences*, 9(2), 255-264.
- Nyka"nen, A., Weckman, K. and Lapvetela"inen, A., 2000. Synergistic inhibition of *Listeria monocytogenes* on cold-smoked rainbow trout by nisin and sodium lactate. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 61, 63–72.
- Prasad, M. M. and Seenayya, G., 2000. Effect of spices on the growth of red halophilic cocci isolated from salt cured fish and solar salt. *Food Research International*, 33, 793-798.
- Rostamzad, H, Shabanpour, B., Kashaninejad M. and Shabani ,A., 2010. Inhibitory impacts of natural antioxidants (ascorbic and citric acid) and vacuum packaging on on lipid

- oxidation in frozen . *Iranian Journal* of Fisheries Sciences, 9(2), 279-292.
- Singh, A., Singh, R. K., Bhunia, A. K. and Singh, N., 2003. Efficacy of plant essential oils as antimicrobial agents against *Listeria monocytogenes* in hotdogs. *Lebensm.-Wiss. u.-Technol*, 36, 787–794.
- Solomakos, N., Govaris, A., Koidis, P. and Botsoglou, N., 2007. The antimicrobial effect of thyme essential oil, nisin, and their combination against *Listeria monocytogenes* in minced beef during refrigerated storage. *Food Microbiology*, 25, 120-127.
- **Tassou, C., Koutsoumanis, K. and Nychas, G-JE., 2000**. Inhibition of Salmonella entritidis and Staphylococcus aureus in nutrient broth by mint essential oil. Food Research International, **33**,273-280.
- **Ultee, A., Bennik, H. J. and Moezelaar, R., 2002**. The phenolic hydroxyl group of carvacrol is essential for action against the food-borne pathogen *Bacillus cereus*. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*, 68, 1561-1568.
- **Vandendriessche, F., 2008.** Meat products in the past, today and in the future. *Meat Science*, 78, 104–113.
- Varnam, A. H. and Evans, M. G., 1991. Food borne pathogens. Wolf Publishing Ltd, pp. 235-265.
- Wang, Ch. and Shelef, L. A., 1992. Behavior of *Listeria monocytogenes* and the spoilage microflora in fresh cod fish treated with lysozyme and EDTA. *Food Microbiology*, 9, 207-213.
- **Youzbashi, M., 2001**. Study of Iranian essential oil. PhD .Tehran: University of Tehran.